



Assessing the effectiveness of migration programs in Africa: an overview of methodological approach of selected case studies and the research findings

Ibrahima Amadou Dia (Postdoctoral Researcher NTNU, Norway – International Migration Expert)



The effectiveness of migration policies and programs: a brief overview of debate

➤ The effectiveness of migration policies has been debated in the migration literature.

On the one hand, notwithstanding stringent migration policies especially in economically advanced countries, **lack of effectiveness of these policies to curb migration flows.**

On the other, the increasing sophistication and securitization of international migration and its effects **on reducing migration flows** considered as evidence of the effectiveness of migration policies.

The complex patterns, flows, dynamics and trends of migration, the variety of stakeholders and interests, and the pitfalls underlying the conventional migration models and the “one size fit all” model, conceptual, theoretical, methodological problems, lack of funding, lack of political will, constraints in evaluating costs and impacts, and other challenges are such that assessing migration policies and programs is a daunting task.

Lessons drawing on evaluation of migration policies and programs in Africa, with a focus on migration statistics and data

1. First case study: Dia, I.A. (2011) Assessment of labor migration policies, programs and legislations in Senegal (with IOM)

Strengthening national capacities in labour migration management through an assessment of:

- Data collection and mechanisms on labour migration
- Institutional structures and coordination mechanisms
- Legislation, policy and implementation on labour migration
- Recruitment practices
- Support services for migrants and protection mechanisms

Objectives of this Assessment plan include also:

Lessons drawing on evaluation of migration policies and programs in Africa, with a focus on migration statistics and data

- Analyzing the labour migration flows in and from Senegal with a focus on the migrant flows to the E. U. and North Africa, including Libya and gender perspective
- Qualitative survey with key players about existing bilateral cooperation with Spain on labour migration

Lessons drawing on evaluation of migration policies and programs in Africa, with a focus on migration statistics and data

- ❑ Taking into account “the value of subjective human interpretation of the evaluation process”, therefore, this evaluation methodology will be mainly based on qualitative model;
- ❑ Collecting and assessing relevant data related to various aspects of labour migration flows and policies in Senegal. In this regard, the evaluation process shall underline the problems concerning data collection and ways to offset them.

Lessons drawing on evaluation of migration policies and programs in Africa, with a focus on migration statistics and data

- ❑ Identifying key players and their strategies (different Ministries (labour, youth, Senegalese overseas, interior, etc; representatives from employers and workers' organizations, business and civil society organizations, migrants and their families, etc.). Accordingly, using a triangulation method approach (combining focus groups, semi structured interviews, analysis of secondary data, etc.) to better understand the “arena” which is labour migration;
- ❑ Contributing to the formulation of effective policies with regard to the labour migration flows using a comparative perspective (analysis of national legislations and policies, identification of some international good practices and conditions for their replicability)

Lessons drawing on evaluation of migration policies and programs in Africa, with a focus on migration statistics and data

OBJECTIVES	STRATEGIES AND ACTIVITIES
Definition and scope of the problem, compilation of relevant data about labour migrant flows, legislation, laws and bilateral agreements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><input type="checkbox"/> Data collection using various information source, semi structured interviews, “informal” interviews with specialists, focus groups<input type="checkbox"/> Main sources: local and international institutions specialized in migration and / or labour laws, academic and research institutes, human rights NGOs, statistical institutions of countries of origin and destination

OBJECTIVES

A bibliography of relevant document of labour migration in Senegal, in the West Africa region and internationally

STRATEGIES AND ACTIVITIES

- ❑ Major sources of dissemination of information: IOM, UN and other specialized agencies, OECD countries, Universities, research centers, different ministries, NGOs,**
- ❑ Electronic sources of data (IOM, etc);**
- ❑ Published and unpublished papers, proceedings, conference papers, articles from newspapers and press highlights**

OBJECTIVES	STRATEGIES AND ACTIVITIES
<p>Qualitative survey with different stakeholders and members of working groups, “needs assessment</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">□ Design of the semi structured interview, test and conducting interviews with key respondents □ Sample strategy and identification of key respondents through the support of IOM Dakar □ Qualitative interviews with key players, namely representatives of ministries, lawyers, labour market and migration specialists, representative from workers and employers’ organizations, key informants among migrants and migrants’ associations, policymakers at international level, etc.

OBJECTIVES

Data analysis of the information collected

Comparative approach on best practices examples at international level

STRATEGIES AND ACTIVITIES

Statistical analysis using Excel or SPSS wherever appropriate, qualitative analysis using Atlas. Ti

- Identification of a methodology for good practice (definition, scope, criteria, etc.)**
- Best practices collection**
- Analysis of the conditions of their replicability in Senegal and in the West African region in general**
- Brain storming, interviews with specialists**

OBJECTIVES

Implementation of the roadmap

STRATEGIES AND ACTIVITIES

- Suggested policy recommendations and implications for better management of labour migration and development friendly labour migration policies**
- Participation in consultations with working committee about the policy implications of the assessment**
- Enabling well informative policy options migration by providing empirically driven data**
- Implementation assessment, monitoring**

Lessons learned from the evaluation of labor migration statistics and data

- a) Weakness of the national statistical system (lack of funding, problems of terminology, concepts, methods, sampling, lack of accurate and reliable disaggregated data on labor migration, etc.).
- b) Lack of social valuation of the local expertise by institutions in charge of migration.
- c) Lack of evaluation, monitoring and follow up of projects and programs related migration statistics and data and lack of dissemination and mainstream of the findings of migration surveys into policymaking.
- d) Problems related to the harmonization of migration concepts and methods in international comparative terms.

Recommendations to address gaps in labor migration data and statistics

- a) Involve statisticians, demographers, and computer specialists into institutions in charge of migration.
- b) Enable access to migration data and statistics and sharing of experience and good practices.
- c) Strengthen cooperation and partnership with international organizations, NGOs, academic and research institutions, etc.
- d) Manage and update database on migration.

e) Establish an effective national statistics system responsible for periodic collection of disaggregated statistical data on all aspects of migration, including labor migration.

f) Strengthen cooperation on migration statistics and data at national, regional and international levels.



2 Case Study: Dia, I. A. and Cisse A. (2020) Guidelines for assessing the level of implementation by Member states of the ECOWAS Protocol on free movement of persons, the right of residence and establishment (ILO-ECOWAS)

Objectives

- Put in place mechanisms to measure progress accomplished, successes and gaps on the framework of the implementation of ECOWAS Protocols on free movement
- Contribute to make the ECOWAS space a borderless region: ECOWAS Vision 2020: from ECOWAS of states to ECOWAS of people

Principles of the Guidelines

Political responsibility of the ECOWAS Commission.

- **Ownership** by the member states of the Community of the evaluation process;
- **Inclusion of** all the stakeholders to generate and restore the confidence;
- **Accessibility and simplicity of the evaluation process**, easy to be understood, monitored and exploited by all stakeholders;
- **Efficiency so that** the costs are reasonable and bearable by the member states.

Evaluation Process

- **Phase 1 – Establishment of the evaluation system** with i) a Regional Steering Committee (CRP); (ii) National Cells; and (iii) a Team of Experts (TE).
- **Phase 2 – Ensuring stakeholders' participation**
- **Phase 3 – Launching the Process**
- **Phase 4 – Preparation of country reports**
- **Phase 5 – Preparation of the regional evaluation report**
- **Phase 6 – Monitoring the implementation of the action plans**
- **Phase 7- Follow up action plan implementation**

Assessment tools

Two main tools:

- The logical framework of results which will help in illustrating all the logics of coherence between different scales of the results chain but also between indices and the objectives they are supposed to measure;
- A reporting Format: a form which helps to put information about indices in order.

- Result framework

Results (desired changes)		Objectively verifiable indicators wording
Level of results	Results description	
Impacts	Contribution of integration to the improvement of the living conditions of ECOWAS citizens	Share (%) of integration in human development index
	Increase of the contribution of integration to the economic development of member states	Share(%) of integration in the GDP growth of member states
Effets	Improvement of integration of member states	Integration index
	Increase in exchanges between member states	Share(%) of intra-community exchanges in ECOWAS global exchanges
Products on the right to establishment	Citizens freely establish their company in a member state of their choice without discrimination	Number of citizens who have established their enterprises in a member state of their choice without discrimination
	National legal instruments on entrepreneurship are in accordance with ECOWAS provisions on the matter	Percentage (%) of national legal instruments that conform to ECOWAS provisions on the subject matter
	Enterprises of the ECOWAS community have a legal access to public markets in all member states	Percentage(%) of enterprises that have legal access to public markets in all member states
Products on the right to residence	Citizens reside freely in a member state of their choice without worry	Number of ECOWAS citizens freely residing in a member state of their residence without worries
	Residing citizens should not suffer any discrimination in access of job in the member state of their residence	Number of citizens who are victims of discrimination in job access from their member state of residence
	Citizens have access to the social protection system in the member state of their residence	Percentage(%) of citizens who have access to social protection of their member state residence without discrimination
	International conventions concerning residing workers' rights are ratified by the member states	Number of member states who have ratified international conventions on the right of resident workers
	The citizens have access to the education system, health, shelter and land without discrimination	Share of citizens who are victims of discrimination in access to education, health, shelter and land
Product on the right of entry	Entry visa is not required from ECOWAS citizens at countries' borders	Number of countries that have abolished entry visa
	The citizens have a good knowledge of the provisions on the right of entry	Percentage (%) of citizens that have good knowledge of the right of entry
	Illegal barriers are dismantled at official borders	Number of citizens who are victims of illegal barriers and/or of violence.
	Bad practices by controlling agents at official borders are abolished	List of bad practices regularly observed by border custom inspectors
	Agents who are guilty of obstructing entry of ECOWAS community citizens at official borders will be sanctioned	Share(%) of custom agents obstructing entry of community citizens at official borders who are sanctioned
	The citizens use the same documents at official borders entry	Documents required from citizens at official borders
	Check points are integrated in the official borders	Number of check points at official borders

Result framework

Activities on the Right of entry	Adoption by member states of protocols on the right of entry	Number of protocols on the right of entry adopted by member states
	Transposition by member states protocols on the right of entry	Number of protocols on the right of entry transposed by member states
	Custom agents carry out sensitization activities of the people on the right of entry	Number of custom agents who carried out sensitization activities on the right of entry protocols
	Member states carry out sensitization activities of the people on protocols concerning the right of entry	List of sensitization activities of populations on protocols concerning the right of entry carried out by member states
	The required personnel (by sex and rank) are deployed to borders	List of personnel (sex and rank) deployed to the borders
Activities on the right of residence	Adoption by member states of protocols on the right of residence	Number of protocols on the right of residence adopted by member countries
	Transposition by member states of protocols on the right of residence	Number of protocols on the right of residence transposed by member states
	Custom agents carry out sensitization activities of populations on the right of residence	Number of custom agents who carried out sensitization activities on protocols concerning the right of residence
	Member states conduct sensitization activities on protocols related to the right of residence	List of sensitization activities of populations on protocols concerning the right of residence carried out by member states
Activities on the right of establishment	Adoption by Member states of protocols on the right of establishment	Number of protocols on the right of establishment adopted by member countries
	Transposition by Member states of protocols on the right of establishment	Number of protocols on the right of establishment transposed by member states
	Member states carry out sensitization activities of populations on protocols	List of sensitization activities of populations on protocols concerning the right of establishment carried out by member states